
KIM Hyang
Introduction

This paper aims to study the musical *Tsubame* つばぬ (2002), performed by Japanese Warabi-za (theater company), and its recreation in changgeuk (Korean opera based on traditional *pansori*) titled *Jebi* 春燕 (2004), performed by National Changgeuk Company of Korea, based on Joseon tongsinsa using a cross-cultural methodology.

These performances were promoted internationally with a story of Joseon tongsinsa 朝鮮通信使 (Korean delegation), a diplomatic delegation that also took a role on cultural exchange between Joseon and Japan. One of their missions was to repatriate Joseon war prisoners during which they had to confront the tragic reality of war. James Miki took notice of this and

---

1. This work was supported by the National Research Foundation of Korea Grant funded by the Korean Government (NRF-2014S 1A5A2A01015442).
2. Changgeuk is a Korean performing arts based on pansori, a Korean traditional art recognized as one of UNESCO’s “Masterpieces of the Oral and Intangible Heritage of Humanity” on November 7, 2003. Changgeuk originated and developed from the art of divided singing in the early 1900s. It utilizes Korean traditional elements, but is nonetheless considered a 20th century modern art performed by *pansori* singers.
3. Original play by James Miki, translated by Chon Hwang, directed by Yi Yun-taek, with music from An Suk-son. It was performed at Main Hall Hae of the National Theater of Korea from Friday, October 29 to Wednesday, November 3, 2004.
4. Joseon tongsinsa was a diplomatic delegation sent to Japan 12 times a year for 204 years during King Sejong’s reign. For three missions after the Japanese Invasion of 1592, it was sent under the name “envoys for repatriation.” The word “repatriation” was used because of the problem regarding returning prisoners of war from the Hideyoshi Invasions. From 1607 (40th year of Seonjo’s reign), the name “tongsinsa” meaning “communicate with trust” began to be used, and with the 12th delegation in 1811 (11th year of Sunjo), the Joseon tongsinsa missions came to a close. The dispatch of Joseon tongsinsa was an important activity embedded with historical meaning on cultural exchange between Joseon and Japan. The Joseon tongsinsa encountered Japanese customs in various ceremonies and banquets, deeply experiencing Japan’s culture. They also learned that there were descendants of Baekje among the performed music and dance of Edo spread to Japan from the Korean peninsula (Song 2011, 195-200).
5. This production was performed at the APEC regular culture event held in Korea on August 29, 2005. It was also formally invited to the “Asia Pacific Week” held in Germany on September 16 and 17 of the same year, receiving international recognition.
6. James Miki was a writer at the Japanese national broadcasting company, NHK. Miki learned about the Joseon tongsinsa while writing a Japanese historical drama in 1995. He became greatly inspired by the tongsinsa’s spread of Korean culture. Miki conceptualized the story by referring
dramatized the story of the Joseon woman in the musical *Tsubame*.

While the two productions *Tsubame* and *Jebi* share the same premise and plot, they vary on certain key cultural elements and stage embodiments. For instance, while both productions deal with the meeting of Japanese and Korean cultures, they emphasize different cultural characteristics. *Jebi* and *Tsubame* demonstrate reflection on the Japanese militarism and consciousness on the need to respect Korean pen-centric 文人 culture. Especially, *Tsubame* shows the Japanese militarism, while also portraying an enviable picture of Korean culture. However, *Tsubame* could not characterize heroine Jebi’s sorrow as political emotion. In other words, heroine “Jebi” was not simply a gift-wife of Japanese samurai but a diaspora who could not return to homeland for political reasons.

Two performing arts seemed to embody universal awareness of militarism on the histories and cultures of Korea and Japan but *Tsubame* showed the heroin...
“Jebi” as one of the slaves rather than a diasporic subject. This complex point is why this paper approaches *Tsubame* and *Jebi* using a cross-cultural methodology.

Cross-cultural methodology began with studying similarities and differences between the East and the West, or between different literatures. The field expanded beyond literature to encompass comparative studies between different forms of media including television, hypertexts, and stage performances. It is an extremely useful methodology for discussing cultural discourses, ideologies, race, and gender (Bernheimer 1995, 42-45). According to cross-cultural scholar Weisstein (1989, 65-66), even two productions produced through translations, emulations, and relationships of mutual influence between two different cultures must be examined in the complete form of each production. Even though two productions have been produced within influential relationships, each one expresses its independent sensibility distinctive from the other, and the originality of each may be concretely exposed through cross-cultural examination.

There has yet to be any study using cross-cultural methodology on these two performing arts. There exists, however, a master’s thesis where the author discusses the musical characteristics of *Jebi* (Choi 2007). The thesis focused on three of the songs in *Jebi* written by An Suk-son: “The Broken Wings Wet with the Times,” “I Feel as if I am Dreaming!,” and “Baby, Let’s go to Cheongsan.” Choi pointed at polyphonic style of the songs that combines duets, trios, solos, and pangchang (chorus from backstage that is audible only to the audience) and discussed how they are interlaced in polyphonic methods rather than simply sung in unison. Although the thesis has significance for discussing musical skills of *Jebi*, it does not remark on how the changgeuk creates political meaning within the performing arts, which will be discussed in this paper.

The originality of this paper used translation theory based on “intermediary” theory (Tieghem 1999, 154-57). According to Tieghem, intermediary makes the cultural movement possible between two countries and this can be conducted by “individual persons” or “social condition.” Tieghem asserts that the “study of intermediary” mainly helps to handle the problem of “translation.” Therefore this paper will study James Miki (writer and director), Chon Hwang (literal translator), Yi Yun-taek (the director), and An Suk-son (the song writer) as “intermediary.” In this case, *Tsubame* was written by James Miki based on Joseon tongsinsa story and changgeuk *Jebi* has been translated by a Chon Hwang as well as Yi Yun-taek and An Suk-son. And according to
Laurence Venuti (1998, 62-66), Chon, Yi, and An were “collective group of cultural translators.” Since “translation itself is a way of cultural communication or an extensive movement occurring between systems, and the movement between different cultures through the literature,” translation of musical *Tsubame* into changgeuk *Jebi* can be said to have been “culturally translated” by collective authors. They were intermediary and collective authors. This article, with its focus on cultural translators, requires application of a number of cultural translation theories.

According to Roman Jakobson, there are three forms of translation. The translation of *Tsubame* into *Jebi* used these forms; namely, one that transfers one language to another and the translation of symbols, which is language translated into non-verbal forms. Specifically, the story of Joseon tongsinsa was produced as a musical in Japan first and then translated into a form of “changgeuk” in Korea, which shows the cultural translation happening through international and musical sensibility beyond the simple literally texts. Japanese and Korean collective authors translated Joseon tongsinsa story into musical and changgeuk forms inserting their cultural elements and sensibility and were the “intermediaries” with different perspective about postwar victims, diaspora.

Diaspora refers to the phenomenon of the individuals or groups forced out of their homes by war or trafficking, and dispersed to new places of living. The heroines of the two works have become alien residents in Japan after being enslaved during the Hideyochi Invasion (1592). In other words, they are diaspora by definition. The Korean changgeuk *Jebi* highlights the aspect of “war-produced diaspora” of the heroine. In particular, *Jebi* is embedded with the sentiment of *han*(恨) of the heroine, who desperately desires to return to her home country. Such perspective had not been accentuated in the musical.
While taking a remorseful attitude toward Japan's militarism, *Tsubame* displays “personal sympathy” toward the heroine. These different emotions are the focal point of this article discussed through a cross-cultural theory.

Diverse approaches are adopted for this discussion, not only in terms of structure, stage space, bodies of singers, but also by taking the audience reviews of the East and West into consideration. Inclusion of receptive research, in particular, helps to identify different emotions and their significance, as well as illuminate the limitations of *Tsubame* and the accomplishments of *Jebi* as works of cultural translation.

Cultural mediating and Creative Transforming of the Story

In writing *Tsubame*, James Miki, writer and director, was actually inspired by historical Korean documents. As a cultural intermediary of *Tsubame*, he wrote it based on the ancient “Story of Joseon Women,” recorded on November 28, 1624 in “Dongsarok” 東槎錄 by Kang Hong-chung, an official of Joseon tongsinsa. Kang arrived in Hikone-han, Japan, as a member of Joseon tongsinsa, and recorded stories of his encounter with Joseon women there:

Two women who called themselves daughters of *yangban* (nobleman of Joseon) came looking for military officials of Joseon tongsinsa to ask about news of their hometown. However, it was hard to communicate with them, as they have forgotten most of Joseon language as they have been taken away from home a long time ago. All they could do was to ask about the welfare of their parents repeatedly, while in tears. I asked them whether they will return to Joseon or not, but, they pointing at the young child with them, said it would be difficult because of their son. (Kang 2008, November 27, 1624)

From the quote above, we can discover that Miki derived stories from Kang's anecdotes of Joseon tongsinsa meeting Joseon women who miss their homeland and family. Based on this, Miki has created a fictional story of a woman named

---

10. The original text is as follows: "有被擄二女人，自稱兩班之女，來見軍官輩，欲問鄕國消息，而被擄已久。盡忘我國語音，不能通話，只問父母存歿，泣涕漣漣，問其欲歸與否，則指小兒而已云。蓋以有子故難之也.”
“Oen (=Tsubame),” also a Joseon woman married to a Japanese samurai named Mizushima Zenzo, with whom she also has a son. Oen was taken to Japan and was offered to Toyotomi Hideyoshi first, and after his death, became a concubine of Lord Inaomasa of Hikone, and upon his demise was handed over to his faithful servant Zenzo. Oen’s journey of becoming Zenzo’s wife shows the “gift wife system” of Japanese culture during 16th century. Joseon women taken as prisoners of war were treated as war trophies. This exhibits an aspect of Japan’s past militarism. The story takes place 10 years after Oen became married to Zenzo, when she encounters her former husband Yi Kyongsik. Yi came to Japan as an official of Joseon tongsin-sa. The setting in which Yi Kyongsik meets Oen who has lived as a gift wife according to Japanese militarism works as the decisive factor that brings conflict in this story.

When the Japanese Tsubame was translated into Korean, “Oen” 走燕 was translated as “Yeoni” 燕. The main story of Yeoni being a gift wife which leads to a tragic ending was also maintained. However, with a different director and writer, the changgeuk Jebi partially changed Tsubame’s structure, its staging as well as characters. The following table compares the dramatic structure of the two performances according to each act and scene.

Table 1. Comparison between Tsubame and Jebi’s Scenes on Space and Time

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Space and Time</th>
<th>Musical Tsubame</th>
<th>Changegeuk Jebi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Prologue: Hikone-han Geicho Year 12 (April 1607)</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>① Sound of raging waves before the curtain goes up. M1(^{11}): “Swallow” of salpuri (exorcism) beat. Yeoni, wearing white clothes, appears with spirits leading her and dances the salpuri dance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>① M1: “Swallow” (theme tune) Joseon tongsin-sa picture screen. M2: “The Joseon Tongsin-sa is Coming” Hanpei, the village chief, and two choruses appear, announcing the visit of Joseon tongsin-sa.</td>
<td>② Hanpei, the village chief, appears, announcing the visit of Joseon tongsin-sa, requesting the village people to watch their manners. M2: “The Joseon Tongsin-sa is Coming” Hanpei’s song and chorus of villagers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>② Zenzo appears, requesting the villagers to watch their manners.</td>
<td>×</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^{11}\) M is the abbreviation for “music.”
### 2) Soanchi

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scene</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>③</td>
<td><strong>M3: Dance of boys</strong> 小童. <strong>Pangut</strong> is put on in the midst of Joseon tongsinsa proceedings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>④</td>
<td>Senior statesmen of Hikone-han meet Joseon tongsinsa for the first time. Members of Joseon tongsinsa emphasize that they are envoys of repatriation, requesting Japanese to return Joseon prisoners of war. They convey the message of the king of Joseon to respond to Japan's sword with pen.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>⑤</td>
<td><strong>M4: Koma dance.</strong> Yi Kyong-sik is surprised to find Oen among the dancers. Japanese senior statesmen say that all dancers are daughters of high-ranking officials in Japan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>⑥</td>
<td><strong>Inner Space</strong> ⑥ <strong>M5: Yi and Oen sing the theme “Swallow.”</strong> The song talks about longing for one's wife and homeland.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>⑦</td>
<td><strong>Intermission Song</strong> × ⑦ <strong>M7: Koyukki and Hitara Pungo sing “Yasakuraye” (Nighttime Cherry Blossom Viewing).</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>⑧</td>
<td><strong>M6: Oen’s song.</strong> She says that she will stay in Japan with Zenzo.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>⑨</td>
<td><strong>M8: Song of Yeoni and Zenzo.</strong> Mother-in-law Sesu appears with a baby in her arms. She worries about Oen changing her mind to stay later on.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>⑩</td>
<td><strong>M7: Oen dances as Zenzo watches her.</strong> Yi comes looking for Oen, asking her to return to Joseon with him.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>⑪</td>
<td><strong>M10: Song of Yi searching for Yeoni.</strong> Yi comes looking for Yeoni. M11: <strong>Song of Yeoni expressing her longingness to return home.</strong> M12: <strong>Flashback—The pain of Joseon people dying on a burning warship is expressed in a group dance.</strong> Yi asks Zenzo to part with Yeoni.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 3) The House of the Mizushima Family

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scene</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>⑨</td>
<td><strong>Yi comes looking for Oen, asking her to return to Joseon with him.</strong> M7: Oen sings about her situation of not being able to return, followed by Yi singing a song about longing to return home with Oen. Yi asks Zenzo to part with Oen.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>⑩</td>
<td><strong>M8: Oen dances as Zenzo watches her.</strong> ×</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Space of Reminiscence</td>
<td>4) On board the Warship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>① The wind fiercely rages at night, and the image of Joseon people shouting for help on a chaotic ship is embodied in a group dance.</td>
<td>× (Already shown as a flashback in the previous scene.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>5) The House of the Mizushima Family</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>② The Mizushima family members gather together to discuss their political relations. They believe they cannot let Oen go even if the shogunate ordered the return of war prisoners. Zenzo says that they should follow Oen’s decision.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Geicho Year 12 (May 1607)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>① The Mizushima family members gather together to discuss their political relations. They believe they cannot let Yeoni go even if the shogunate ordered the return of war prisoners. Zenzo says that they should follow Yeoni’s decision.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Surihari Hills</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>① Oen appears. She says that she has been to Surihari Hills. The family then emphasizes that she is a daughter-in-law of the Mizushima family.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The House of the Mizushima Family</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>① Zenzo notifies Oen of the shogunate’s decision to return war prisoners to Joseon and hands her a letter from Yi. He also tells her that her parents are alive and tells her to return to Joseon.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inner Space</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>① M9: Chorus of women singing “Swallow.” Oen reads Yi’s letter. She dances and cries as she misses her parents.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>6) Soanchi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>① Joseon tongsinsa and Hakone statesmen celebrate the success of the talks.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Geicho Year 12 (June 1607)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
6) Soanchi
Geicho Year 12 (June 1607)

① M11: Hanpei's song of a Japanese festival is followed by *samulnori* of Korea. Japanese mask theater is performed along with *samulnori*. M12: Joseon's Jindo-Airang and Japan's festival song are then combined, for a more festive atmosphere.

7) Street

⑩ Sinsaburo stops Yi, who is on his way to the house of Mizushima family. Zenzo then appears, rescuing Yi and asking him for forgiveness.

⑩ Matsuri Dance is performed again.

8) The House of the Mizushima Family

③ M13: “Although the Moment has Come” Oen sings about longing for her homeland. Her song is followed by Yi’s sharing his hope for his wife to return. This is followed by Zenzo singing about his pain of having to let Oen go. A trio singing about the tragedy caused by war follows.

⑩ M18: “Baby, Let’s Go Cheongsan” Yeoni sings about longing for her homeland.

M19: Yi sings a song that encourages Yeoni, while Zenzo sings about having to let Yeoni go.

M20: “Baby, Let’s Go Cheongsan” is sung in a trio.

9) The House of the Mizushima Family

⑩ The day Oen is supposed to leave. Pungo appears and says Zenzo got an order of hara-kiri (self-disembowelment) in a closed-door confinement under a charge of letting his gift wife return to Joseon. Oen wails.

⑩ The day Yeoni is supposed to leave. Pungo appears and says Zenzo got an order of hara-kiri (self-disembowelment) in a closed-door confinement under a charge of letting his gift wife return to Joseon. M21: Yeoni sings about getting confused between Yi, who is waiting for her and Zenzo, who she is about to leave. Prostrated by grief, she takes out her *eunjangdo* (ornamental silver knife) and commits suicide.

10) Street

⑩ Kihei notifies Zenzo of Oen’s suicide.
A Study of the Diapora Problem in Japanese and Korean Performing Arts Based on Joseon Tongsinsa

11) Osaka Dock

At the dock, Yi and So Chong-chung lament about the small number of returning Joseon war prisoners.
M14: “Did the Heart Change?” Yi sings his anxious heart out, waiting for Oen, while her image appears in the atmosphere.
M15: “Dance of Wolhwa” Oen dances to the sound of flute under the moonlight and then disappears.

M22: Yi sings his anxious heart out, waiting for Yeoni.
M23: Yeoni appears with oral sound. She is followed by a group carrying a bier.

M24: Funeral rites with souchetsori follows. The bier disappears to the backstage.

Zenzo appears announcing the death of Oen. Yi wails.

M16: “Swallow” (a female chorus)
M17: “The Moment Will Come Again” (a mixed chorus)

(Replaced with souchetsori)

Epilogue

Yeoni dressed in white clothes appears with spirits leading her to dance salpuri dance and then disappears.

As shown in Table 1, the musical *Tsubame* and the changgeuk *Jebi* are divided into 25 and 24 scenes, respectively. There are 17 songs inserted in the musical and 24 songs in the changgeuk. These two productions fundamentally share similar space, time, and narration, but they show a few differences in details.

Scenes ②, ⑩, ㉒, and ㉔ of *Tsubame* were omitted in *Jebi*; while scenes ③, ⑪, ⑯, ⑱, and ㉕ of *Tsubame* were replaced with other scenes in its Korean counterpart. Scenes ①, ⑦, ⑫, ⑰, ⑲, ㉒, and ㉔ of *Jebi* were newly written and inserted in the changgeuk.

The following scenes in *Jebi* were not seen in the original: 1) the banquet scene where Joseon tongsinsa and Hikone senior statesmen meet for the first time; 2) flashback scene showing the warship on fire; 3) the banquet scene in Soanchi when Joseon tongsinsa finish the talk with Tokugawa Ieyasu and return to Joseon; and 4) the final scene. The congratulatory banquet scene in *Jebi* was notably different from that of *Tsubame* for its distinctive Korean traditional
performing arts: for example, *pangut*\(^12\) where Joseon artists play vigorous music. At the same time, *taepyongsoso-sinawi* and *kyonggi-taepyongso* while dancing in different colors and vibrant *sangmonori*, were performed in *Jebi*. The final scenes, from Yeoni’s funeral rites to a personification of her spirit, stress the case of Joseon woman forced to commit suicide as a result of Japanese militarism.

Aside from the aforementioned scenes, we can also find some comic sentiment in newly added scenes that allowed the mood of the performance to alternate between tension and relaxation. For example, the interlude song “Yasakuraye” (Nighttime Cherry Blossom Viewing) arouses delightful mood in scene ⑦, similar to another where the Mizushima family appear. This “repetition of tension and relaxation” is one of changegeuk’s features based on *pansori*. By writing and inserting scenes that “repeat tension and relaxation” and combining them into a well-organized production, *Jebi’s* collective authors created a mix of both “dramatic” and “episodic” structure composed of tragic and comic sentiments. Specifically, whereas *Tsubame* has a well-organized structure that follows a linear passage of time, *Jebi* transformed it into a cyclical passage of time. *Jebi’s* structure is open to new scenes, such as “the interlude song of Koyukki and Pungo,” “playground in Surihari Hills,” and “the appearance of father and mother,” all of which do not exist in *Tsubame*. The prologue and epilogue of *Jebi* where Yeoni is shown wearing white clothes and performing the Salpuri Dance\(^13\) were also added, and these scenes built a cyclical time structure in *Jebi*. This also produces internal logic through sentiments rather than the completion of the story.\(^14\)

---

12. *Pangut* is a combined art of music and play conducted by *georipae* and *namsadangpae*. The performance is divided into two parts: in the first half, various formation plays are staged. These are followed by individual performances in the second half, showing different *nori* like *sangsoinori*, *solchanggunori*, and *sogonori*. Twelve *sangmo* spinning long tapes on hats and *sorigut*, where *gutpae* sing folk songs are staged (*Encyclopedia of Korean Culture*, “Pangut”; available at https://encykorea.aks.ac.kr/Contents/Index).

13. The Salpuri Dance is a dance to release negative energy and shun evil spirits. The dance does not have any religious functions, but rather an entertaining or artistic dance performed to the tune of *salpuri* melody of shamans. The Salpuri Dance’s mournful tone was generated from the social condition in which *han* and sorrow could only be overcome through art. However, it is not simply a dance of sorrow. It goes beyond that and reflects how it can be into the world of affection and joy. In other words, it is a dance that expresses the sentiments that are intrinsic to humans (*Encyclopedia of Korean Culture*, “Salpuri”; available at https://encykorea.aks.ac.kr/Contents/Index).

14. While Aristotle argued the superiority of “(well-organized) dramatic structure,” he also
The cyclical structuralization of changgeuk *Jebi* is based on Yi Yun-taek and An Suk-son’s reinterpretation of *Tsubame*, which centered on Koreans bearing the “*han* 恨 of homesickness.” They chose to highlight these sentiments. While Japanese *Tsubame* can be seen as a self-reflective commentary on Japan’s militarism seen from the Japanese perspective (Zenzō), the Korean version *Jebi* sees Japan’s militarism in the eyes of Koreans (Yeoni). In other words, while the structural translation of *Jebi* accepts the thematic consciousness of *Tsubame*, it intensifies its Korean traditional and cultural sentiments and takes a more critical perspective, that of the “diaspora.”

In the process of mediating critical consciousness of *Tsubame* into Korean culture, the translators of *Jebi* enhanced the tragic sentiment of the formal work. Therefore, they expressed the appropriate strategy—the episodic structure of the cyclical structure—and succeeded in diaspora discourse development. It showed who were unable to return home. The ultimate objective of diaspora, as scholars explicate, is to return to their homeland (Safran et al. 2008, 1). *Jebi* especially emphasizes the frustration of such hopes. Yeoni’s dance in the prologue and epilogue scenes signifies such emotion during the Joseon diaspora. In other words, *Jebi* has successfully embraced the tragic structure of *Tsubame* and underscored the Korean diaspora’s painful experience in history. It could be commented that *Jebi* shows the tragic and nostalgic elements of diasporic life.

**Cultural Hybridity and Local Culture on Stage**

Structural differences of *Tsubame* and *Jebi* may also be noticed in the way they were staged. *Tsubame* is composed of 11 acts and *Jebi* has 12 acts. They are: “Prologue,” “Soanchi,” three acts of “The House of the Mizushima Family,” “Onboard the Warship,” “Street,” and “Osaka Dock.” It should be noted that aside from “Prologue” and “Epilogue,” all of the other acts impose dramatic spaces. The space of “Soanchi” and “The House of Mizushima Family” are repeated the most throughout the productions. “Soanchi” is where Joseon
tongsinsa appear and Joseon culture materializes, while it was during “The House of Mizushima Family” when a typical Japanese living space is created. The design of “Soanchi” in *Tsubame* and *Jebi* exhibits apparent cultural differences.

In the “Soanchi” of Hikone, Joseon tongsinsa come into conflict with Hikone senior statesmen over the issue of returning Joseon prisoners of war. They express their anger towards Toyotomi Hideyoshi. At the same time, they argue that Joseon is trying to overcome its anger toward militarism with “the culture of Pen 文.” Accordingly, they show an effort to engage in diplomacy through culture by showing different Korean traditional arts, crafts, dance, and songs. However, during the first half part of *Tsubame*, the Koma Dance performed in scenes ③, ④, and ⑤ of “Soanchi” is a hybrid Korean-Japanese dance from Koryo 高麗. This is an example of “cultural hybridity,” a dance at the “border line” between two cultures. Also, in scenes ⑥, ⑦, and ⑧ in the latter half, the *miyalhalmi* chapter of Korean mask theater is reenacted, and its Japanese counterpart is put to the sound of Korean *samulnori*. Japanese festival songs and Jindo-Arirang are also sung in overlap. This combination of Korean and Japanese dances and music evokes the “sinmyeong (exhilaration 神明) of boundary space.” In “Soanchi,” this “dance and sinmyeong of border between two cultures” is staged, and create the unique hybrid sensibility of *Tsubame.*
After that, this hybrid sensibility disintegrates the spatial consciousness that the “Soanchi” placed in Japan. It is transformed into a “liminal space” (Turner 1996, 207-08), where Korean and Japanese cultures meet and create a disparate image. In here, Joseon tonginsa’s anger toward Toyotomi Hideyoshi and the combination of Japanese and Korean traditions occur at the same time. It thus becomes a “liminal space” of indeterminate image where sinmyeong (exhilaration) coexists.

In Jebi, Korean and Japanese cultures do not come together in “Soanchi.” Instead, each is manifested as a separate, traditional local culture. In the process of translating “Soanchi” of Tsubame, the changgeuk director changed scenes ③, ④, and ⑤ in the first half part as a procession with splendid music and dance. The Koma Dance was also changed to appear fully “Korean” on stage. Furthermore, in scene ⑥, there is no Korean performance, but Japanese matsuri 祭り. Dance is reenacted through scenes ⑰ and ⑱. In other words, Jebi’s “Soanchi” differentiates and shows each country’s traditional culture. Such directing emphasizes the special culture of each country, and it is further developed through the ritualistic space materialization in scene ⑲ “Surihari Hills,” and scenes ㉓ and ㉔ in “Osaka dock.” Souchetsori is commonly sung during these two instances. In “Surihari Hills,” this song is performed in a group work setting, whereas in “Osaka Dock” it is performed along with the appearance of the funeral bier and the procession of Korean traditional funeral rites. In “Surihari Hills,” the group Salpuri Dance is a ritual for the ban of

---

15. Matsuri, which translates to “festival,” generally signifies public and joyous religious ceremony. The word “matsuri” comes from the word “matsuru” 奉る, which means a pictograph of offering a sacrifice by raising both hands. It indicates the condition in which not only the sacrifice and the two hands are united, but also the mind and heart. Matsuri was originally a religious action, but when people gather for a collective event like a celebration or propaganda, it is often called “matsuri.” In a wider sense, it signifies a religious ritual, but the word also encompasses events, funerals, ancestral rites, and ritual to treat a disease, rite to release a dead soul’s resentment, and the act to cleanse dishonesty (available at http://terms.naver.com/entry.nhn?docId=1833111&cid=42999&categoryId=42999).

16. “Souchetsori” is a type of folk song passed down to all regions of Jeju Island, and was originally a song in shamanism. Despite this, it has an entertaining aspect that haenyeo (a female diver) sings it when she rests, and is also used during weeding fields. The melody and composition are comparatively steady and eloquent (Encyclopedia of Korean Culture, “Souchetsori”; available at https://encykorea.aks.ac.kr/Contents/Index).
Joseon diaspora taken away from their homeland and are now living in Japan, while in “Osaka Dock,” Korean traditional funeral rite is performed to appease the han of Yeoni who had no choice but to commit suicide without being able to return to Joseon under the militaristic order.

The fact that distinct characteristics of each local culture is highlighted in Jebi seems to be because the Korean translators perceived the narration of Japanese musical Tsubame as a story of Korea, while conducting an “ethnocentric” translation to put it on Korean stage (Fischer-Lichte 1990, 283). Japanese matsuri, the group dance in Surihari Hills and Korean traditional funeral rites are performing arts that pursue emotional solidarity of a collective community. Thus, it is a Korean translation bearing the desire for a sustained peace of a local community. The Korean ethnocentric translation did not disregard the original culture or exhibit a postcolonial critical awareness. Rather, it emphasized distinct cultural features by exposing communal consciousness of each culture. In addition, removal of cultural hybridity in Jebi was not intended to exclude the Japanese culture, but rather merely to “highlight” Korean rites, particularly authentic funeral traditions. It is meant to console for spirit of the dead. Simply put, Jebi embraced communal reconciliation of Tsubame and intensified the Korean local rite to mourn the death of Korean diaspora.

Songs of the Body as the Other

Including spatial embodiment of various traditional performances, characters’
songs adapted by Yi Yoon-taek deepened the diaspora’s sorrow in *Jebi*. He increased the number of original songs in scenes ④, ⑦, ⑨, ⑩, ⑫, and ⑮ in the process of culturally translating *Tsubame*. Songs added were “Answer the Sword with the Pen” which expresses the significance of Joseon tongsinsa; Yi’s M13 lines trying to convince Yeoni to change her mind as she decided to stay in Japan; M15 of Yeoni’s parents who long for their daughter; and Yeoni’s M16 as a response to her parents.

Yi’s M13 lines maintain the framework of the original lines in *Tsubame*.17 The scene’s general message is that “Oen’s current situation is not one by fate and that he has the right to bring his wife back from Japan.” At the same time, the song expresses his strong resentment and desire for revenge. Most of all, it shows Yi’s determination to change “fate.” Yi of *Jebi* shows a lot more irrational sentiments than Yi of *Tsubame*. This difference can be inferred from the intention of Korean translators. The “perspective of the victim” has been applied and reflected, for which they made the original lines stronger.

Meanwhile, M15 is from a scene where Yeoni’s parents ardently express their longingness for their daughter. In the original text, news of Yeoni’s parents’ survival is delivered only through Zenzo’s lines. In *Jebi*, this is revived in a fantasy, deepening Yeoni’s desire to return to her homeland. The song of Yeoni’s father waiting for his daughter’s return in a yearning sound displays deep han. This is emphasized on the repetition of her father’s line, “Let’s go to Chungsan,” in songs M18 and M20. The latter, in particular, shows three sorrows of Yeoni and Yi’s yearning from han and Zenzo’s pain for sending Yeoni back to Joseon. “Let’s go to Chungsan” shows thematic consciousness of *Jebi*, “han of homesickness.”

---

17. The original text is as follows: “李慶植: 何か運命だ. イルボン国が戦を仕掛けなければ. こういうことはならなかったのだ. 私にはイルボン国から妻を奪い返す権利がある” (Miki 2002, 35).
아이야 청산가자

Figure 4. The Score of Trio, “Let’s Go to Chungsan” of Jebi
Yeoni’s song, M16, is a response to the father’s song and shows Yeoni’s strong desire to return home for the first time before M18. In contrast, in Tsubame, this scene is expressed through Oen’s dance, with movements that express her happiness on hearing her parents’ survival. In Jebi, Yeoni expresses her desire to return home. As she sings, Yeoni takes off her Japanese clothes which reveals the white hanbok (Korean traditional clothes) she had been wearing underneath. In Jebi, it is a scene where Yeoni reveals her true desires, which she had been hiding from Zenzo.

Yeoni’s song M21 also does not exist in Tsubame. It is a scene where Yeoni struggles between loyalty for Zenzo and love for Yi, where she does not want the former to die, but at the same time her heart leans toward the latter. The scene shows Yeoni trying to leave, only to be stopped by the Mizushima family. Feeling devastated, she then commits suicide. In Tsubame, this scene is displayed as Oen screaming and being in pain, although it stops short of showing that she is dying. The difference is that while the translation explicitly reveals Yeoni’s internal struggles and its commensurate consequences, Tsubame is more abstract, relying on her irrational screaming and a slightly grotesque facial expression to show her inner conflicts.

Songs written for Jebi, but were not in Tsubame, include a Tsubame narration enhanced to show the emotions of resentment, anger, longing heart, and love caused by memories of losing loved ones during the war as well as the diaspora. It appears that while the diaspora of Joseon people is personified through the character of Yeoni, her family left in Korea also expresses a similar diasporic sentiment of missing a member of their family. Again, the emphasis given by the Jebi translators on the struggles of Yeoni’s family is a way to underscore more the oppression caused by the diaspora. Joseon people are set up as the “other” (Butler 2009, 42-45), as trophies of the war or as subjects to be eliminated. Because Yeoni is a gift wife, she was not allowed to join other Joseon people returning home, while Yi is almost killed by Zenzo’s younger brother Sinsaburo. Jebi emphasizes this aspect by adding songs not found in the Tsubame. It criticizes Japan’s militarism, nationalism, racism, and sexism through them. The diaspora embodied through the characters are formed in the context of Japanese militarism. For instance, even though the Japanese have interactions and exchanges with Joseon, it is difficult for Yeoni as a gift wife to return to her homeland and be reunited with her family. In short, they are people of the “old diaspora” (Kim 2010, 54-55). In the “old diaspora,” material oppression is even
deeper than the “new diaspora,” where contemporary movement is possible. This “old diaspora” sentiment was what was difficult for *Tsubame* to express. This is a unique diasporic sentiment that must have been hard even for Miki who had an excellent understanding of Korean culture. Changes were made in *Jebi* as can be seen in the translators’ attempt to embody these original Korean culture sentiments more vividly.

**Significance and Reception to Tsubame and Jebi**

*Tsubame* and *Jebi* drew different responses from the audience when they were performed in Japan, Korea, and Germany.

③ This performance was really sad. I think I would have probably cried if I watched it alone. I have never experienced war in my lifetime, but I think all those who did would be thinking “if only there were no war.” There must have been many lovers and husbands and wives that got separated because of war. I thought that peace is truly noble. How distressed she must have been as she was doubly pressured between her former husband and the current one.... (Female, 22 years old)

④ “I wanted to send Tsubame back to Joseon....” I could not stop crying at Zenzo’s thought. I could relate the play to current reports of abductions by North Korea. I have read a few books related to the North, and I had an image of “a closed and distant country.” The anti-Japanese sentiment in South and North Korea is passed down from generation to generation, and from the perspective of us Japanese, it was something that we thought was “tenaciously emotional even though times have changed.” Something we could not understand. Yet we do believe that contemplating on personal grief and sorrow will never heal the scar. (Female, 37 years old)

⑤ This performance has a strong message that made me think about a lot of things. The part that made me most excited during the play was when Korea and Japan sang and danced together. I was deeply touched to see two different cultures coming together in harmony to become one excellent thing. I like dancing, too, so I wanted to dance with them. Also, all actors put in so much passion into their every move, making it truly a great performance. (Male, 20 years old)
The above quotes are comments on the message board “Opinions about the Performance” of the Japanese musical website. They show varying appreciation of the play. Focusing on the comment Ⓐ, it is clear that while the audience displays anti-war sentiments, she nevertheless views the conflict among Oen, Zenzo, and Yi Kyong-sik as a simple marital conflict. She overlooks the fact that the tragedy of the three characters was caused by the Japanese invasion of Joseon, but rather considered their relationship a mere love triangle. Meanwhile, the 37-year-old female Japanese has a different a view. For one, she considers “Korea” to include both North and South Korea. This is because current relations between North Korea and Japan are tense for various reasons, hence, a Japanese watching Tsubame may connect that with the decades-ago conflict between Korea and Japan shown in the play. A bigger difference is that Japanese audience members seem to fail to see Oen as a symbol for the Korean diaspora. They did not mention her “otherness,” or the problem of social minorities. Audience Ⓑ stated that “contemplating on personal grief will never heal the scar,” indicating her view of the conflict as a personal problem. This seems to overlook Japan’s invasion of Joseon as the cause of the characters’ suffering. Finally, while audience Ⓒ expresses interest in traditional Korean culture, he displays scant knowledge and awareness of the political relations between Japan and Korea, which is the subject of the play. This lack of historical awareness makes him perceive traditional Korean culture as a “foreign culture” with the main focus on what is superficial and only seen to the naked eye. In general, Japanese audiences tend to display “sympathy” toward the characters of Tsubame, but do not show a sense of responsibility for the Hideyoshi invasion and colonization of Joseon while also exhibiting Japanese chauvinist thinking through their supposed “enjoyment” of Korean traditions.

Meanwhile, Korean viewers showed different responses about Jebi.

The creative changgeuk Jebi is a tragedy that occurred when Yi Kyong-sik visited Japan as part of Joseon tongsinsa to meet his wife Yeoni, who he thought got lost during the Hideyoshi Invasions. It is a lively changgeuk production that throws many themes to the audience such as freedom, love,

and choice of the individual in the face of history’s violence.  

① Amid fate of being born as a subject of a weak country against one’s will, we are people who had a history of anguish like Jebi, the main character of the drama. However, I found it ironic that the Japanese not ourselves, would write a good production like this and propose it to us. I think I feel this way even more because now we cannot even openly cry for the sad sufferings of our ancestors like those of the comfort women.

② When the story is examined, it suits better that this is performed by Koreans than the Japanese. Of course, the story of a woman of sorrow with life standing at the crossroads between her former and current husbands is universal, but the background of the story, its development process and emotions are more Korean. It is very interesting to listen to 100% pure Korean music, free of any Western influence. The music also fits very well with the roles, magnifying the dignity of the drama.

The above quotes are comments from the Korean viewers of Jebi found on internet blogs. They knew that Jebi was recreated from Tsubame, and sympathized with the suffering of their ancestors, hailed Korean culture and regretted Japan’s militarism that James Miki wanted to show through Tsubame. In particular, audience ① interprets Yeoni not merely as an individual, but as a symbol of Joseon that was then infringed upon by Japan. The viewer also criticizes Koreans for not participating enough to demand justice for comfort women during the war. This shows a stark difference between Korean and Japanese audiences. Koreans see Japan’s militarism, which caused their country’s sufferings, as something which cannot be easily forgiven. Hence, while the Japanese audience quoted earlier saw Tsubame and cried tears of sympathy from Zenzo’s perspective, their Korean counterparts seemed to have more interest on how the story was conceptualized and from the perspective it represented the Hideyoshi Invasions of Korea by Japan. Thus, their comments not only refer to

the entertainment aspect of changgeuk, but also reflect the historical awareness. They evaluated *Jebi* from a distinct Korean perspective, focusing on culture and traditions as well as historical consciousness.

Although *Jebi* was not performed in Japan, it was staged in Germany and received fresh reviews from foreign audiences. For instance, German newspaper *Zeitung* expressed interest in the stylistic aspect of changgeuk, saying that they can see why Brecht was captivated by Asian theatre. The paper said: “the changgeuk *Jebi* surprisingly connects to epic theatre established by the German Brecht and the illusion theater (Aristotelian). The characters act out the story and explain it too, and the course of events is stopped by decorative structures rather than acting (descriptive) skills, which brings pleasure to the audience.”

Such an opinion seems to show how the drama’s episodic elements were strengthened from *Tsubame* by the translators of *Jebi*.

The German press also expressed respect toward master singer An Sukson who played the role of Yeoni and mentioned the deep sorrow and despair they felt in her singing, particularly in the scene before she commits suicide. It is noteworthy that the newspaper chose to title the review as “Frauen schenkt man nicht zurück,” which means “We are not back to Woman.” This title can be interpreted as referring to Japan’s militarism that prevented Yeoni from going back to her home country. This is different from Japanese audiences’ view that seemed to sympathize more with Zenzo than with Oen. The German paper seemed to sympathize not with Zenzo’s position, but with Yeoni’s tragic death. It also mentioned how the final scene was composed of elements of Korean folk beliefs. Still, while the reviewer emphasized changgeuk’s aesthetics and did not directly mention the diaspora, the title of the review suggests that it viewed Japan as the assailant.

In sum, through the comments on *Tsubame* and *Jebi*, we can see that different viewers showed reactions corresponding to their creative and cultural backgrounds. Some Japanese who watched *Tsubame* sympathized more with

---

22. The original text is as follows: "Staunenswürdigerweise findet sich hier sogar das Illusionstheater mit dem von Brecht gegen dieses konstruierten epischen Theater verbunden: Die Figuren spielen die Geschichte, sie erzählen sie aber auch und haben überdies Freude daran, den Gang der Ereignisse durch das Ausbreiten eher ornamentaler als darstellender Kunstfertigkeiten zu unterbrechen" (http://www.berliner-zeitung.de/archiv/die-koreanische-oper--die-schwalbe--bei-den-asien-pazifikwochen-frauen-schenkt-man-nichtzurueck,10810590,10320886.html).
Zenzo than the Joseon diaspora portrayed through Oen because the latter was not underscored or fully embodied in the Japanese musical. On the other hand, Koreans who watched the translation Jebi focused not only on the Korean traditional entertainment elements that they believe surpassed the Japanese production, but also sympathized more with the struggles of their ancestors more vividly depicted by the Korean characters in the process of cultural translation in Jebi. Similarly, the distinct of Korean changgeuk seemed to have also left a strong impression on some German audience who saw Jebi.

Jebi, the cultural translation of Tsubame, is similar to, but also highly distinctive from the musical Tsubame. Hence, it is only natural that the responses from Korean and German audiences who watched Jebi are different from those of Japanese audiences who watched Tsubame. However, responses by the Japanese still show that Miki, Tsubame director, is remorseful about the Japanese militarism yet lacks an adequate awareness of Oen’s han. This explains why the Japanese audience consider the conflict among the characters as a simple relationship conflict rather than trace it back to history. It is difficult to conclude that Miki held an imperialist point of view, but his work can be considered to display a chauvinist perspective. It seems that such aspects of the work have been well received by the Japanese audience.

In light of the fact that Germany also shares a history of colonization with Japan, German audiences’ appreciation of Korean artistry in changgeuk as well as their view of Yoeni as a diaspora shows that Jebi, as a translation, seemed to speak to people from East and West, imbibing a sense of sympathy to the international audience. Based on such findings, it can be concluded that Jebi works as a symbol of “glocalization” (Kang et al. 2010). Jebi enacts as the “glocalizing” artifact because of the deep introspection on Korea’s history and the ordeals, as well as the determined recognition of cultural identity, that sought to unfold Korea’s history through performing arts.

Conclusion

This paper was a study on Wàrabi-za’s musical Tsubame and Korean Changgeuk Company’s changgeuk Jebi using the theory of cultural translation. This article was a cultural comparative research between two stage performances based on Joseon tongsinsa, the envoys of Joseon to Japan during the Japanese invasion.
Both performances dramatized the story of a Joseon woman, but it was found that the tragic emotion of main characters has been more emphasized in the cultural translation work of Korean changgeuk *Jebi*. This paper analyzed the transformation in the methods of diasporic discourse. In the process, it examined similarities and differences between the two shows, by examining their distinctive structures, stage works, and audiences' responses, using cross-cultural methodology.

On the surface, both shows can be seen as a pair of co-produced dramas about Joseon tongsinsa that share a critical view on the violent militarism of Japan. However, they actually showed different cultural identities. It was very significant that *Tsubame* raised a question on Japanese militarism and showed a self-reflective attitude. However, Miki, after all, has not overcome Japanese chauvinist way of thinking. He displayed limited thinking in musical *Tsubame*. On the contrary, *Jebi* expressed the Joseon people and their diaspora with strong empathy, not only to criticize Japanese invasion, but also to console war victims using Korean traditions and rituals. *Jebi* embraced communal reconciliation of *Tsubame* in the spatial embodiment and intensified the Korean local rite to mourn the death of Korean diaspora. It had a great effect on Korean and German audiences and helped them to realize the violence of militarism in the face of Korean ordeals in history. As a result, this article concludes that *Jebi* accomplished “glocalization” through changgeuk by embracing Japanese culture on the stage while expressing awareness against recurrent wars and diaspora.

References


Butler, Judith. 2009. *Contingency, Hegemony, Universality*. Translated by Daejin
Park and Misun Park. Seoul: Doseochulpan b.


Song, Ji-won. 2011. “Korean Diplomatic Missions 朝鮮通信使 to Japan:


**KIM Hyang** (hkimm@yonsei.ac.kr) is an assistant professor of Sungkyul University and a researcher of Research Center for Performing Arts in Yonsei University. She received her Ph.D. in Korean Modern Drama and Performances at Yonsei University. Her academic interests include Korean traditional and modern musical drama in the aspects of cultural contents.
Abstract

This article is a study on Warabi-za’s Musical *Tsubame* つばぬ and Korean Changgeuk Company’s changgeuk *Jebi* 春燕 based on Joseon tongsinsa 朝鮮通信使 (Korean delegation) with the theory of cultural translation. Changgeuk *Jebi* is a recreation of musical *Tsubame*. Korean director and composer translated *Tsubame* into Korean performing arts changgeuk. Both performances dramatized the story of Joseon woman who lived in Japan, but it was found that the tragic emotion of main characters has been more emphasized as it was culturally translated into Korean changgeuk *Jebi*. And this paper analyzes this transformation with a diasporic discourse. In the process of the study, this paper examined similarities and differences between two shows focusing on their structure, stage space, bodies of singers on stage and audiences’ response of East and West using cross-cultural methodology. As a result, it was found that *Tsubame* showed a self-reflective attitude on Japanese militarism but still maintained Japanese chauvinist way of thinking. On the other hand, *Jebi* asserted Joseon woman as diaspora with empathy not only to criticize Japanese invasion but also to console victims of war with Korean traditional ritual. It had a great effect on Korean, Japanese, and German audiences and helped them to realize the violence of militarism and self-examine the ordeals of Korean history depicted through Korean traditional ritual arts. Therefore this article commented that *Jebi* accomplished “glocalization” by embracing Japanese culture on stage and expressing awareness against recurrent wars and diaspora.

**Keywords:** Joseon tongsinsa 朝鮮通信使 (Korean delegation), changgeuk, intermediary, diasporic discourse, self-reflection, glocalization